# **Court of Appeals, Division One**

Civil Appeal

# 1 CA-CV 23-0444

# ROBBINS v. EMERALD, et al.

# **Appellate Case Information**

Case Filed: 20-Jul-2023

Case Closed:

**Dept/Composition** 

# Side 1. VIVIAN ROBBINS, an individual, Plaintiff/Appellant

(Litigant Group) VIVIAN ROBBINS

Vivian Robbins

Dustin Birch, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 35958) Alexander R Arpad, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 21660)

Attorneys for: Plaintiff/Appellant

Side 2. EMERALD SPRINGS ASSISTED LIVING, LLC, a foreign Limited Liability Company, doing business in Yuma County, Arizona; THE GOODMAN GROUP MN, LLC, a foreign Limited Liability Company, doing business in Yuma County, Arizona, Defendant/Appellee

(Litigant Group) EMERALD SPRINGS ASSISTED LIVING, LLC, et al.

• Emerald Springs Assisted Living LLC

• The Goodman Group MN LLC

Attorneys for: Defendants/Appellees

David S Cohen, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 16888)

Anne E Holmgren, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 33042)

Arcangelo S Cella, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 37176)

# CASE STATUS

Mar 19, 2024....At Issue

PREDECE	SSOR CASE(S)	Cause/Charge/Class	Judgment/Sentence	Judge, Role <comments></comments>	Trial	Dispo
YUM	S1400CV202200206	Negligence		Lawrence C Kenworthy,		
				Authoring Judge of Order		

#### OPEN DUE DATE

Additional Record Due Due By: Monday, April 15, 2024

Re: FILED: Memorandum – to Clerk of Superior Court Re: any additional record not already transmitted due within 10 days

#### PENDING MATTER

**Div 1 Request for Oral Argument** 

Request for Oral Argument (Appellant)

Filed: 19-Mar-2024

#### CASE DECISION

17-Nov-2023 ORDER

ORDERED: Dismissing this appeal. [Appeal reinstated per

order filed 12/20/2023]

Melina Brill.....Author

Filed:	17-Nov-2023	Mandate:
		Decision Disposition
Dismissed		

26 PROCEEDING ENTRIES				
1.	3-Jul-2023	FILED: Notice of Filing of Appeal (Courtesy Copy)		
2.	20-Jul-2023	FILED: Index of Record, Notice of Appeal from Yuma County Superior Court filed 06/22/23		
3.	20-Jul-2023	FILED: e-Record on Appeal: Instruments/Minute Entries Exhibits: Hearing Date 8/29/22 1, 2, 2A		
4.	20-Jul-2023	FILED: Appellate Clerk Notice re: Appellant's Fee/Case Management Statement/Brief Due		
5.	24-Jul-2023	FILED: Appellant's Notice of Payment of Filing Fee; Certificate of Service (Appellant)		
6.	26-Jul-2023	FILED: Notice of Payment of Filing Fee; Certificate of Service (Appellee)		

# **Court of Appeals, Division One**

**Civil Appeal** 

# 1 CA-CV 23-0444

ROBBINS v. EMERALD, et al.

	26 PROCEEDING ENTRIES				
7.	27-Jul-2023	RECEIPT No.: 2023-00690 ; \$280.00, Authorization: 08009303251, Applied to: VIVIAN ROBBINS - Class A Filing Fee (\$280.00) Paid for: Clear Counsel Law Group - By nCourt LLC			
8.	31-Jul-2023	RECEIPT No.: 2023-00701; \$140.00, Authorization: 12007414709, Applied to: EMERALD SPRINGS ASSISTED LIVING, LLC, et al Class B Filing Fee (\$140.00) Paid for: Jones Skelton & Hochuli PLC - By nCourt LLC			
9.	31-Jul-2023	FILED: Appellate Clerk Notice re: Appellee's Fee; Appellant's Brief/Case Management Statement Due			
10.	9-Aug-2023	FILED: Case Management Statement (Appellant)			
11.	15-Sep-2023	FILED: Motion for Determination of Jurisdiction; Certificate of Service (Appellant)			
12.	15-Sep-2023	ORDERED: Vacating the 09/18/2023 due date for the opening brief. The order ruling on the pending motion will set a due date to file the opening brief, if the court determines it has jurisdiction over this appeal. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author			
13.	25-Sep-2023	FILED: Defendants/Appellees' Response to Motion for Determination of Jurisdiction; Certificate of Service (Appellees)			
14.	5-Oct-2023	ORDERED: Motion for Determination of Jurisdiction (Appellant) = GRANTED. FURTHER ORDERED: The opening brief is due by 11/06/2023. If the opening brief is not timely filed, the court will dismiss this appeal. Hon David B Gass - Author			
15.	17-Nov-2023	ORDERED: Dismissing this appeal. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author			
16.	1-Dec-2023	FILED: Plaintiff/Appellant's Motion for Reconsideration; Motion for Reconsideration Notice of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant)			
17.	4-Dec-2023	ORDERED: Requesting that appellees file a response to the motion (motion for reconsideration) by 12/18/2023. FURTHER ORDERED: Appellant may file a reply in accordance with ARCAP 6(a)(2). The court will rule on the motion following expiration of the time for a response and reply. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author			
18.	13-Dec-2023	FILED: Defendants/Appellees' Response to Motion for Reconsideration; Order Re: Response; Certificate of Service (Appellees)			
19.	18-Dec-2023	FILED: Plaintiff/Appellant's Reply to Response Filed by Appellees/Defendants Emerald Springs Assisted Living, LLC; Emerald Springs of Yuma, LLC; and the Goodman Group MN, LLC; Certificate of Service; Plaintiff/Appellant's Reply to Response Filed by Appellees/Defendants Emerald Springs Assisted Living, LLC; Emerald Springs of Yuma, LLC; and the Goodman Group MN, LLC (Certificate of Compliance) (Appellant)			
20.	20-Dec-2023	ORDERED: Plaintiff/Appellant's Motion for Reconsideration (Appellant) = GRANTED as to the dismissal order, and reinstating this appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Denying appellant's request for the court to reconsider its 10/05/2023 ruling on appellant's motion for determination of jurisdiction. FURTHER ORDERED: The opening brief is due by 01/19/2024. If the opening brief is not timely filed, the court will dismiss this appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Denying appellees' request for sanctions without prejudice to appellees requesting sanctions in the answering brief. Hon David B Gass - Author			
21.	29-Dec-2023	FILED: Notice of Appearance; Certificate of Service to Notice of Appearance (Appellant)			
22.	19-Jan-2024	FILED: Opening Brief; Certificate of Compliance to Opening Brief; Certificate of Service to Opening Brief; Copy of Memorandum Decision filed 05/31/2022 re: case 1 CA-CV 21-0496 (Appellant)			
23.	28-Feb-2024	FILED: Answering Brief of Nominal Defendant/Appellee Emerald Springs Assisted Living, LLC; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellee)			
24.	19-Mar-2024	FILED: Request for Oral Argument; Certificate of Service to Request for Oral Argument (Appellant)			
25.	19-Mar-2024	FILED: Reply Brief; Certificate of Compliance to Reply Brief; Certificate of Service to Reply Brief (Appellant)			
26.	5-Apr-2024	FILED: Memorandum – to Clerk of Superior Court Re: any additional record not already transmitted due within 10 days			